

PERIODICAL ROOM
GENERAL LIBRARY
UNIV. OF MICH.

JUL 3 1944

CLASSICAL WEEKLY

VOL. 37, NO. 19

April 17, 1944

WHOLE NO. 995

THE LATER LATIN (Mierow)

REVIEWS

KLIER, Language Teaching in Wisconsin Public High Schools 1941-1942 (*White*); COMMISSION ON TEACHER EDUCATION, Teachers for Our Times (*Stinchcomb*); PLUMPE, Mater Ecclesia (*Arbesmann*)

ABSTRACTS OF ARTICLES



•
•

ULLMAN
and
HENRY

LATIN FOR AMERICANS

Develops to more opportune levels for American boys and girls today those values of the study of Latin which relate to the American way of life and its ancient origins.

FIRST BOOK
\$1.84

SECOND BOOK
\$2.40

Send for illustrated
booklet

THE MACMILLAN COMPANY

New York : Boston : Chicago
Dallas : Atlanta : San Francisco

CLASSICAL WEEKLY

Published weekly (each Monday) except in weeks in which there is an academic vacation or Armistice Day, Thanksgiving Day, Christmas, New Year's Day, Washington's Birthday, Easter, or Memorial Day. A volume contains approximately twenty-five issues.

Owner and Publisher: The Classical Association of the Atlantic States. Place of Publication: University of Pittsburgh, 4200 Fifth Avenue, Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania. Printed by The Beaver Printing Company, Greenville, Pennsylvania.

James Stinchcomb, Editor, University of Pittsburgh, 4200 Fifth Avenue, Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania.

Franklin B. Krauss, Secretary and Treasurer, Pennsylvania State College; Box 339, State College, Penna.

Contributing Editors: Lionel Casson, Jotham Johnson, Eugene W. Miller, Charles T. Murphy, J. C. Plume, Bluma L. Trell.

Price, \$2.00 per volume in the Western Hemisphere; elsewhere \$2.50. All subscriptions run by the volume. Single numbers: to subscribers 15 cents, to others 25 cents prepaid (otherwise 25 cents and 35 cents). If affidavit to invoice is required, sixty cents must be added to the subscription price. For residents of New York, New Jersey, Pennsylvania, Delaware, Maryland, or the District of Columbia, a subscription to *CLASSICAL WEEKLY* (or, alternatively, to *The Classical Journal*) is included in the membership fee of The Classical Association of the Atlantic States, whose members are also entitled to *The Classical Outlook* and *The Classical Journal* at special prices in combinations available from the Secretary-Treasurer.

Entered as second-class matter October 14, 1938, at the post office at Pittsburgh, Pa., under the Act of March 3, 1879.

Acceptance for mailing at special rate of postage provided for in the Act of February 28, 1925, authorized October 14, 1938.

Volume 37 contains issues dated: October 4, 11, 18, 25; November 1, 15, 29; December 6, 13 (1943); January 3, 10, 17; February 7, 14; March 6, 13, 20, 27; April 17, 24; May 1, 8, 15, 22; June 5 (1944).

MEMORANDA

Two interlocked objectives very important to the schooling of wartime America are made easy of attainment by the materials traditionally used in part of the Cicero course. "Cicero is an immortal. He belongs to all times and to all ages" and "no adequate appreciation can be had of the subsequent culture of which Rome is mother without an understanding of the great Roman," declares Sister Francis Joseph, I.H.M., of Marygrove College, Detroit, writing in a recent issue of *School and Society* (59.204-7) on the significance of these aims.

The orations offer the teacher an opportunity to exercise "mature guidance in open and unemotional discussion of economic policies and democratic ideals." A comment on the importance to young thinkers of seeing relationships between current events and trends and their antecedents in history leads to the remark that "a study which develops in youth this capacity to see relationships is highly practical." Such a study is most valuable when it provides at the same time lessons in the "knowledge of the technique of the art of persuasive writing."

The material of the Cicero course in which Sister Francis Joseph finds her richest opportunity for synchronizing lessons in expression with those in dispassionate reasoning is the speeches on the Manilian Law and Archias. The fact that she refers to the invectives of Cicero only by implication makes a reader wonder whether this teacher would not concur in much that is being advocated by Pennsylvania teachers, for instance, Thomas S. Brown of Westtown School, who finds in selections from *De Republica* the material for ardent discussions of social and rhetorical value.

In the formative period of life a portion of the younger generation must come in touch with the poets of Greece at first hand in the original tongue. This wellnigh perfect expression of the human spirit, appealing to the universal elements of humanity, will

again be transferred afresh into the universal thought and language of literature, and in this way reach the great company of every land who cannot of themselves drink from the original fount.

HENRY SAYRE SCRIBNER

Subscribers who will be at temporary addresses for the Summer are requested to notify the editor's office to allow prompt delivery of issues delayed by the present shortage of help at the printing shops.

Several New York University instructors are reported in a news release to be contributing to the present avid discussion of changes possible in language teaching. Recent experience in intensive language training has given impetus to wide consideration and a few experiments of the changes in American colleges necessary before that experience can be utilized. Although none of the instructors quoted thought it feasible or desirable for the colleges to duplicate the controls which have been active in these recent military courses, they agreed in general that the amount of time for foreign languages in the undergraduate curriculum should be increased. Professor H. Stanley Schwarz of the French department thinks eight hours, preferably ten, the proper share of a week's program for mastering a language in which "after the second year students should be capable of entering any advanced course in literature." Professor Ernst Rose of the German department would have the schools "provide our colleges with enough linguistically prepared students so that the colleges can concentrate with greater vigor on their more specialized finishing tasks." He points out further that the military teaching has only demonstrated the ability of American students to learn languages effectively and the importance of letting the language teachers decide how much time is needed for language mastery. "Heretofore we have ever so often been hampered," says Pro-

Day,
issues:
4200

Trell.
bers:
cents
Dis-
ership
classical
1938.
17;

bought
in the
selves

ER

es for
office
pres-

ported
t avoid
hing.
g has
experi-
nary
none
desir-
which
they
reign
ld be
French
the
lan-
should
litera-
ment
with
the
more
that
bility
and
decide
Here-
Pro-

fessor Rose, "by a too skimping allotment of time, by the assignment of students interested in the language requirement only as an obstacle to overcome before

entering upon their real career, and by a restriction of methods enforced upon us by a general unwillingness of educators to recognize our needs."

THE LATER LATIN

When I took my first course in Mediaeval Latin under Dean Andrew F. West, now many years ago, I made the acquaintance of the monumental work by Du Cange, the *Glossarium mediae et infimae Latinitatis*. Its very title somehow conveyed the impression that I was descending into the depths: that the literature I was now about to study was at best only mediocre, and that the language in which it was expressed would be definitely low. Nor were my forebodings allayed by the Latinity of the Gothic historian of the fifth century, Jordanes, whose priceless record of his own race I presently sought to read and to understand.

But I soon learned that not all the later Latin writings are expressed in barbarously ungrammatical phraseology and style. The earliest masterpiece of Christian Latin literature, the *Octavius* of Minucius Felix, standing perhaps on the borderline of the classic and the mediaeval, or at least of the pagan and the Christian, may serve as a kind of bridge. We are reminded by it of Cyprian's dictum: *Latinitas et regione mutatur et tempore*. So we find in this quasi-Ciceronian dialogue some 250 non-classical expressions: archaisms, new words, old words used with specifically Christian meanings, many new abstracts, poetic constructions and habits of thought. Yet it is intrinsically no more difficult to read than Apuleius.

Perhaps even more suitable as a transition from classical to mediaeval Latin literature is the sixth-century monograph on St. Severinus by Eugippius, of which Teuffel writes in glowing terms: *die unvergleiche Lebensbeschreibung des heiligen Severinus von Eugippius*. As a historical document, it affords a unique portrayal of the regression of Roman domination—the vacuation of a province of the Empire: *cunctis nobiscum provincialibus idem iter agentibus*.

Notable among historical works of the Middle Ages is the ninth-century *Vita Karoli Magni* by Einhard. The author calls himself *homo barbarus et in Romana locutione perparum exercitatus*. But he is too modest. These words might much more appropriately be applied to Jordanes, the Goth. Though Einhard used the *lingua mixta* of his own time, he seems to have caught much of the charm of style of the older classical Latin. In fact Garrod & Mowat, editing the work in 1915, call it "the literary masterpiece of the Middle Ages." Another golden book of biography is the *Life of Anselm* (1033-1109), archbishop of Canterbury, by the monk Eadmer.

It is not the purpose of this paper to serve as an In-

dex to the later literature, although the volume of mediaeval Latin writings is so tremendous that a "Wegweiser" of some kind seems indispensable. Perhaps a general note of caution should be sounded. Within recent years, since the founding of The Mediaeval Academy and its journal, *Speculum*, the pendulum appears to have swung in the direction of over-emphasis upon the Middle Ages. Undoubtedly this is in part a result of the large number of new books that have made the later Latin writings more accessible to classical scholars and students: such works as the *Mediaeval Latin Word List from British and Irish Sources* (1934); Labriolle's *History of Christian Latin Literature* (1920); Beeson's *A Primer of Medieval Latin* (1925); *Medieval and Late Latin Selections* by C. U. Clark and J. B. Game (1925); *Mediaeval Latin* by Karl P. Harrington (1925); *Early Christian Latin Poets from the Fourth to the Sixth Century* (1929) by O. J. Kuhnmuench, S. J.—to name but a few. It is a natural tendency to overestimate the importance of the new or little known.

It is true that the Later Latin has its place. Its value is, in many respects, unique. But surely it needs but little reflection to convince us that the classical Latin literature of the Golden Age—Cicero and Vergil and Horace above all—is still our most precious possession from the Roman past. These are the writers who have exerted the greatest influence upon later ages, as regards both language and style. In reading the Latin of the Middle Ages we should be careful to discriminate between the values of content and of literary excellence. Many badly written works are nevertheless of great value to historians, philosophers or theologians. But if we seek enduring classics of the Later Latin, we cannot merely browse at will. We must avail ourselves of the guidance of such recognized authorities as those already cited—by no means overlooking the monumental *History of Mediaeval Latin Literature* by Max Manitius (1911 and 1923).

Among the greatest works of the later time are, of course, St. Jerome's translation of the Bible and his Letters; the *Confessions of St. Augustine*; the *Philobiblon* of Richard de Bury (1345), bishop of Durham; and *The Two Cities of Otto of Freising* (1146).

But all the Later Latin looks back to ancient Rome as its source and inspiration:

Prima urbes inter divom domus aurea Roma.

CHARLES C. MIEROW

CARLETON COLLEGE

REVIEWS

Language Teaching in Wisconsin Public High Schools 1941-1942. By FRANK J. KLIER. 78 pages. State Superintendent, Madison (1943)

Because it presents the results of a comprehensive questionnaire sent to the 496 teachers of foreign languages in the public high schools of Wisconsin to which there was a 100% response, this study merits respectful attention. Because it antedates war demands for languages, started in 1943, certain trends of the immediate present are not shown.

Three hundred five, 59.25% of all Wisconsin school systems, offered one or more foreign languages, two hundred six none. In the former only 13% of the school population enrolled in language study. Elections represent many more girls than boys. That of this percentage 7%—more than the number for all modern languages combined—were enrolled in Latin is attributed to the fact that 62% of these schools offered one language only, which was predominantly Latin, German claiming 2.2%, Spanish 1.9, French 1.4, Polish .3, Italian .2. Twice as many girls as boys elected Latin. The distribution by years shows: first year 52%, second 40%, third 5%, fourth 3%. Low enrollments in classes beyond the second year were common to all languages.

The tendency towards decreasing enrollments was attributed for Latin to the re-evaluation of secondary curricula in terms of personal and social living, for French and German to reactions to war situations and for all languages to relaxation of college entrance requirements.

An attempt was made through three independently devised rating scales to get as objective a picture as possible of teachers' interpretation of attitudes towards language programs (parent-community, pupil, and teacher). More than three-fifths of the first group manifested a "beneficial" attitude ("favorable" plus "satisfied" replies), almost a third a "detrimental" attitude ("indifferent" plus "unfavorable"), the attitude toward Latin showing a downward trend. The younger generation showed less interest than the older, their "beneficial" reaction being 20% lower, for which the most common cause assigned was that "students imagined that they found or actually found language study hard and too much work in comparison with other studies." Teacher reactions, in terms of prophecy regarding enrollment trends, were equally divided between "beneficial" and "detrimental," presaging increases in Spanish, a slight downward trend for Latin and greater losses in French and German.

Statistics showed 53% of the Latin teachers working in their major field, while the highest percentage of persons with neither a major nor a minor in the subject appeared in Spanish. Lack of speaking ability of mod-

ern language teachers is emphasized as a serious handicap in the aural-oral approach to teaching. While Latin-German showed the highest percentage among two language combinations, with Latin-French a close second, Latin-English headed those outside the foreign field. Several teachers attributed their successful, well-attended regular language classes to foundation courses in General Language. The report suggests that the Language-Social Studies combination, ranking second, may indicate a new trend in secondary education, paralleling two subjects intimately connected with adapting young people to their environment, and a possible move towards such orientation courses as General Language for pupils not planning to stay in school as well as for future language students. The Language-Mathematics combination, ranking fourth, reflects the shortage of Mathematics teachers. A demand for numerous additional language teachers despite decreasing enrollments is ascribed in part to heavy teacher shifting departmentally. The greatest demand was for the Latin-Spanish combination.

There is little unanimity as to the relative importance of the ten objectives listed, which are strongly reminiscent of those in the Coleman Report. From the findings a "Wisconsin Master List of Objectives" was established: for Latin (1) ability to read with ease and understanding, (2) ability to write Latin correctly, (3) improvement of English vocabulary and grammar, and for the modern languages the same first two plus (3) ability to pronounce and understand the spoken language and to speak it, (4) understanding of other civilizations and peoples, (5) understanding of the structure of English and its relation to other languages, (6) bringing about of spirit of tolerance towards other peoples and languages. While the report cites progress in attainment of objectives since 1929, it voices need of more conclusive data as to carry-over of language study into areas of English. It finds language teaching fully as high in quality as that in any other subject field and suggests that, in order to refute unjust criticism, further research must find answers to four questions: (1) Should students be selected for language study or standards lowered?, (2) Should standardized tests be given at regular intervals, and their results, with other criteria, made the basis for promotion, remedial measures, repetition or discontinuance?, (3) To what extent are teachers' efforts to increase enrollments reflected in the composition, aims and standards of classes?, (4) How can language classes be made more appealing without sacrificing standards and without loss of identity?

The general conclusion as to methods is that best practises show some form of direct approach, the trend being away from grammar-translation procedures. The better training of teachers, broader background of pupils and greater opportunities in large centers of population allow a closer approach there than in smaller

communities to the direct method, which demands more of teachers but produces more satisfying results in increased pupil stimulation. "A conscious or unconscious gradual approach to the reading method" was evident and a possible post-war trend toward placing foreign languages more definitely than now in the social area without sacrificing the acquisition of language tools.

The report concludes with recommendations that pupils be encouraged to develop skills in foreign languages spoken at home, that teachers be granted travel allowances for study abroad, that teacher exchanges be arranged with foreign countries, that salary increases be granted for resulting oral fluency, that language study be either intensified or prolonged, and that achievement be measured by standardized tests. Because the report maintains that in *any* study provision *can* be made for students of varying abilities, it recommends flexible programs in foreign languages, to make it possible for pupils of lower linguistic abilities to obtain real values from their study.

EMILIE MARGARET WHITE

CENTRAL HIGH SCHOOL, WASHINGTON

Teachers for Our Times. A Statement of Purposes by the Commission on Teacher Education. xix, 179 pages. Commission on Teacher Education of the American Council on Education, Washington 1944. \$2

The teacher of the classics at the secondary level (and in the past decade increasingly at adult ages) has had much faith-testing practice in self-evaluation and in examining his function in democratic education. Habitually he looks with concern, almost with suspicion, at each newly published educational forecast to see whether it will further reduce the opportunity allowed his materials and procedures to exert their cultural efficacy, for his faith has been tested on the racks of some very ingenious devils. The book in which the Commission on Teacher Education analyses the teacher's rôle in 1944 can do much to deepen his abiding confidence in his contribution to the kind of education now found to be needed in America.

After a sane and succinct examination of American educational aims and attainments (29-144), a very dull chapter (145-75) treats the titular topic. This concluding statement might have been (probably was) written thirty years ago. It seems only a distant cousin of the livelier earlier chapters. It gives not even a hint of what communities and administrators can do to find socially alert, professionally able teachers or to convince Mrs. Grundy and the other taxpayers that they are worth finding. Boards of Education, trustees, overseers, "in-breeding," and placement agencies are not even mentioned. An introductory description of the training of

teachers (1-28) is both wholly factual and optimistic reading for the compliment it pays teachers by merely showing who they are and what they do. The quality of education depends mainly on them and on the quality of their own education both before and in service. Society finds them worth a training investment and is willing to share in its cost, especially as they tend to be more permanent in their profession. A million Americans are teachers (below college level) and the preparing of teachers for their work is the biggest vocational task of higher education. A fifth of the undergraduate population is expected to turn to teaching, and most of the candidates need expensive supplements to their education for they come from families "relatively modest in circumstances." Young teachers receive more preparatory education than almost any group; five states and many cities demand a five-year collegiate preparation. Even the disparate aims of teacher-training institutions are reconciling themselves harmoniously for the good of the profession although liberal arts faculties are "often at best apathetic towards teacher education." As to teacher training in universities, "optimism may be expressed, though with caution."

The reader of this book is invited to test each of its declarations for himself and in reference to his central interest as well as to general principles. Accepting this invitation, we may see what it says, specifically and generally, to secondary Latin teachers. The real value of the book to them lies in its lively manner of relating American educational principles with American life. Every page is reminiscent of a cherished document now beginning to fall apart with age, the General Report of the Classical Investigation. Teachers of Latin twenty years ago formally tested and adopted aims, correlations, procedures, devices, catchwords and outlooks now being stressed.

The Commission is virtually saying to the Latin teacher that the very reasons for having schools in America are reasons for using Latin as a medium admirably suited to their aims. For instance, the peculiarly American convictions are "in fact a common bond between us and many other nations" especially visible and hence especially studied in our contemplation of the nations of antiquity. Lessons in democracy that is not merely political, in the cultivation of emotional integrity, in the "least specialized of the social sciences," anthropology and sociology, and values applicable to individualism, impersonal relationships and the practice of rational behavior have all been accented by teachers of Latin for years. More significant even are "skill in the communication of thought and feeling, and in the interpretation of the communicative efforts of others" and "reliance on historical perspective." The school is to develop understanding, attitudes and competencies that exactly duplicate objectives in which Latin text-

books and teachers have had four decades of experience. Here we find them thoughtfully catalogued: "attainment of a personal philosophy of existence," sympathy (called sometimes tolerance and "appreciation of the worth of others"), power and practice of rational criticism, "flexibility and ingenuity of mind," assistance from literature and art in knowledge that has been "tested in the fires of experience" and "capacity to make intelligent choices in accordance with values" that are themselves in a continuous process of refinement. We are also to "discourage the tendency to prejudge" and to "improve taste and standards of discrimination." No material so adequately provides the opportunity to do all these many things as that found in the current elementary Latin books.

The teacher's part in the learning process is that which the formalities and exercises of Latin demand day after day, not merely on isolated occasions. He is to be "not only an expert but also a leader" whose influence is the more valuable when it means a "relatively intimate association over a considerable period." More than once we have been told that Latin is notably useful for young Americans because it can provide a full and varied four-year course. The teacher is further to create learning situations for firsthand experiences and to employ group methods, for which the Latin teacher used to be flagellated by those unyielding realists who held that situations were "not practical" or, worse, not truthful.

Even this complete (albeit tardy) agreement with the thinking of Latin teachers is less striking than the community between their glimpses of the future and those revealed to the Commission. Based on a survey of the reasons for America's "passion for freedom," the analysis looks forward to schools in which freedom is no longer merely negative, historically identified with reduction of the control of church and state and, lately, of "standardizing pressures subtly enslaving in effect." The visions of classicists and Commission members alike foresee a freedom ever more active in enforcing democratic controls and in preventing "consumer education" from making us into either faceless hordes or pecuniary tyrants, and a still more robust freedom to respond to emotions guided by rational self-criticism, "the discipline of the artist."

Nor is this the only mention of discipline. The book bristles with the old familiar word which has been in disfavor too long. Equally numerous references employ other shibboleths echoed from the mouths of classicists; relationships, integrity, capacity, communication, responsible personal expression, historical perspective, great works of literature, etc. Besides, teachers must be "well informed, well rounded, effectively participating citizens of the world of today" and have "respect for the infinite variety of man," his social nature and his intelligence, avoiding knowledge that is only an unrelated aggregate of items.

In its general interpretation of education this book will find teachers of Latin commonly sympathetic, although they know that they are blessedly ignorant of some of the needs. The Latin teacher is by his very subject protected from intimate acquaintance with education's blighted areas. There are schools he has never seen and pupils of whom he has read only in passing. Now and then he can regret his immunity, but not when democracy and freedom are being discussed, for these are topics he has studied at their fountain sources in classical antiquity. He has rejoiced when they have made their way into curricula and into school organization. He has told his pupils often that freedom is not mere release from restraint but rather a boon won by self-mastery and self-inspection. He has patiently taught words that carry the symbols of the ideas necessary to attain democratic ideals. He has conned the Founding Fathers of both America and Christianity to ensure the validity of his lessons. He has let his pupils enact, debate and manipulate ancient democratic forms for the greater enjoyment of the modern. He has even occasionally overstepped in sentimentalizing the nobility of good citizenship and the primacy of good administration. Today he can feel himself in step with other teachers in the civic parade. We hope he is marching better because of his longer practice.

Not the least of the satisfactions to the classical who read this Statement will be its favorite example of democratic planning (55-60), a description that tells the story of the Tennessee Valley Authority in the very terminology of Plato, following his distinctions and his distribution of the parts of statesmen, technical expert and worker. America is seen approaching Platonic perfection.

J. S.

Mater Ecclesia. An Inquiry into the Concept of the Church as Mother in Early Christianity. By JOSEPH C. PLUMPE. xxi, 149 pages, 4 plates. Catholic University of America Press, Washington 1943. The Catholic University of America Studies in Christian Antiquity edited by Johannes Quasten, No. 5) \$2

Professor Plumpe's comprehensive study of a highly significant and important idea will be of considerable interest to students of patristics, Church history, history of religion and theology. No attempt has ever been made at an exhaustive inquiry into the earliest history of the concept of the Church as a mother; earlier collections of material have been incomplete and inadequately treated.

This study grew out of a paper (TAPhA 70 [1939] 535-55) in which Professor Plumpe succeeded in showing that the title and the idea of the Church's motherhood was not only widely current but even traditional at

the end of the fourth century, and that it could be traced back to the earliest monuments of Latin Church literature, the writings of Tertullian and St. Cyprian, where the notion of the Church as a mother occurs very frequently and is quite fully developed. The earliest mention of the Mater Ecclesia could thus be assigned to the year 197, the probable date of Tertullian's *Ad Martyras*. At the end of his paper the author raised the question which has now become the main subject of his book; namely, whether there was a *Μήτηρ Ἐκκλησία* when the language of the Church was almost exclusively Greek.

Professor Plumpe has now for the second time worked through Tertullian and St. Cyprian, and has discussed the significance of the pertinent passages in all possible aspects (45-62; 81-108). The methodical thoroughness of his investigation leaves no doubt as to the correctness of his statement "that in the writings of St. Cyprian Africa appears as the classical land of the true *Mater Ecclesia*" (104). With sober Western realism which does not favor theoretical speculation, the African bishop pictures the visible "Mater Ecclesia super terram" who experiences joy and grief through the children she begets. In examining Greek Christian literature which is covered from its beginnings to the early fourth century, the author has been able to make a most important contribution by the discovery of two earlier instances of "Mother" as a direct appellative for the Church (35-44). They occur in a letter written A.D. 177, or the year following, by the Christian communities of Lyons and Vienne to their brethren in Asia Minor and Phrygia (Eusebius, *Hist. Eccl.* V 1.1-2, 8). In an account of their struggles and triumphs, as well as the joys and sorrows of their common Mother, the Church, the confessors of Lyons and Vienne call the Church *Μήτηρ* and *Μήτηρ Παρθένος*. From the spontaneity with which these use the title, it becomes evident that the Church was familiarly known as *Μήτηρ* to the addressees of the letter. To Professor Plumpe's knowledge these two passages contain the earliest preserved instances of "Mother" as a nomen pietatis applied to the Church. That the clergy at Lyons and Vienne fostered the appeal to the *Μήτηρ Ἐκκλησία* is proven by the fact that the works of St. Irenaeus, a contemporary of the Lyonese confessors, reveal the same familiarity with the idea of the Church's motherhood.

Turning to the East and studying the works of Clement of Alexandria and Origen (63-80), Professor Plumpe finds that the catechetical school of Alexandria, renowned for allegorical treatment of Scripture, gave considerable impetus to the notion of the Church as a mother. However, as he points out, it is a purely Scriptural-allegorical *Μήτηρ Ἐκκλησία* which appears in the writings of these Eastern Fathers. The Mother Church of Origen is above all a product of theory and

speculation and has little in common with St. Cyprian's visible Mater Ecclesia *super terram*. At any rate Origen's occupation with the subject indicates that his contemporaries in the Church must have given considerable thought to the Church's place and mission as a mother. Finally, a profoundly mystical portrayal of the Mother Church is found in the *Symposium* of Methodius of Philippi, written before the close of the third century. And yet, making all allowance for his indebtedness to Alexandrian speculation, this writer presents a much more realistic picture of the *Μήτηρ Ἐκκλησία* than does Origen. His portrayal of the Virgin Church's motherhood is strikingly similar to that of the first witnesses of the Mother Church, namely, the Lyonese confessors, who wrote to their friends and relatives in Asia Minor and Phrygia concerning the joys and sorrows of their common *Μήτηρ Παρθένος*.

Since before this date, 177, there can be found no earlier instances of "Mother" as a direct appellative for the Church, Dr. Plumpe examines traditional and local factors which may have given rise to the title and concept of the Church as a Mother. For this purpose he works through all Scriptural prototypes (1-9): here, particularly the famous passage in St. Paul (Gal. 4.26), where the Apostle personifies the celestial City of Jerusalem as a woman and attributes to her motherhood; similarly the extensive Scriptural tradition of the Church as the Bride and Spouse of Christ easily suggested the idea of the Church's motherhood. With careful evaluation of all pertinent factors, the author then considers pagan-Gnostic analogies, especially the possibility that the Great Mother divinities, venerated in the East, might have inspired a second great Christian "mother goddess," the *Μήτηρ Ἐκκλησία*; he comes to the conclusion that the pagan and Gnostic *μητέρες* were hardly consequential factors of the Mother-Church idea (9-14). The important link between the capital Scriptural prototype (Gal. 4.26) and the patristic *Μήτηρ Ἐκκλησία* Dr. Plumpe finds in the *Μήτηρ Πίστις*; this occurs in St. Polycarp's Letter to the Philippians, the *Acta SS. Justini et Sociorum*, and the Shepherd of Hermas (18-20). The latter already contains, at least implicitly, a translation from *Μήτηρ Πίστις* to *Μήτηρ Ἐκκλησία*. The *Κυρία Ἐκκλησία* speaks to Hermas as a mother, although the word *μήτηρ* is not actually used (20).

The arguments adduced for Phrygia as the most likely place of origin of the *Μήτηρ Ἐκκλησία* seem convincing: Phrygian Christians played a prominent part in the early personification of the faith and the Church; Phrygian Christians, too, were the first witnesses for the Mother Church. It was directly from Phrygia, and not from Rome, that Africa received the concept and title which, judging from the surviving documents, were not in use at all in Rome during the

corresponding period. The figure and personification of the Church as Mother Church did not appeal to the sober and straitened imagination of the Romans.

As Professor Plumpe emphasizes, it is altogether likely that pertinent documents and records have been lost. He has covered those which are extant with admirable thoroughness. His work, which contains much other incidental material and valuable information, is a

methodical and erudite treatment of the subject, a model for similar investigations, and a valuable addition to Professor Quasten's series of Studies in Christian Antiquities. The selected bibliography and the splendid detailed indexes of sources, names and topics deserve special commendation.

RUDOLPH ARBESMANN

FORDHAM UNIVERSITY

ABSTRACTS OF ARTICLES

This department is conducted by Dr. Charles T. Murphy of Princeton University, Princeton, New Jersey. Correspondence concerning abstracts may be addressed to him.

ANCIENT AUTHORS

Aeschylus. GEORGE THOMSON. *Review of Professor Thomson's Oresteia*. Criticisms and corrections of some small points as treated by Mr. Kitto in the review, JHS 60 (1940) 110. JHS 61 (1941) 40 (Ridington)

Caesar. WILLIAM HARDY ALEXANDER. *A Pure Well of Latin Undefined*. Argues that "nowhere better than in the Latinity of Caesar's 'Bellum Gallicum' would one come to know what the Latin language could achieve with its own unaided powers." University of Toronto

Quarterly 12 (1943) 415-25 (C. T. M.)

Callimachus. R. PFEIFFER. *The Measurements of the Zens at Olympia*. New papyrus fragments from an epode of Callimachus are presented with suggestions, especially about the measurements, for the reconstruction of Pheidias' work. JHS 61 (1941) 1-5 (Ridington)

Euripides. E. A. THOMPSON. *Notes I*, Medea 777. Suggestion that the core of the obvious corruption in the line is the *έχει* easily explicable from its presence in the next line, also at the end; emendation to *έρω* would give idiomatic Greek and good sense in the context.

Hermathena 61 (1943) 63 (Taylor)

Florus. EDWARD S. FORSTER. *Some Notes on the Text of Florus*. The editor of the Loeb Florus suggests improvements of the text of the following passages: i.1 (i.7.7), T. p. 14, line 4, (retain the manuscript reading and change the punctuation); i.1 (i.2.2) T. p. 9, line 20, (retain the manuscript reading); i.40 (iii.5.13), T. p. 97, lines 12ff., (read *rex Asiae* with N and omit the following *et*); ii.5 (iii.17.4), T. p. 121, line 11, (read *arcessire* for *accesserat*); ii.6 (iii.18.12), T. p. 124, line 4, (read *Rutilius ipse* for *ipse Iulius Caesar*); ii.13 (iv.2.45), T. p. 146, lines 1ff., (read *plausum theatri sui audiens . . . circumsonantem*). The references are to the Teubner edition of 1896.

CR 57 (1943) 12-3 (F. P. Jones)

Hanno. W. L. LORIMER. *Hanno Periplus 3* (G.G. M.i.3). For *δένδρεσι συνήλθομεν* read *δένδρεσιν ηλθομεν*.

CR 57 (1943) 14 (F. P. Jones)

Livy. PAUL JACOBSTAHL. *On Livy XXXVI, 40 (Boian Silver)*. In his account of the triumph of P. Cornelius Nasica over the Boii in 191 B.C., Livy gives a detailed list of the booty which figured in the procession. Plutarch's report, based on Polybius, of the triumph of Aemilius Paulus mentions the carrying of silver and gold coins in vases. In our text of Livy the words 'in

Gallis vasis non infabre suo modo factis' have been misplaced and should be read with 'bigatorum numerorum' rather than with 'argenti infecti factae.'

Horses are mentioned only here in the accounts of Gaulish triumphs. They were of interest probably because of their caparison. While the archaeological record of the Gauls is scanty in second century Italy, the horse-trappings can be illustrated by a contemporary set found in the province of Brescia, the only silver ones of Celtic origin preserved. These are Insubrian, but the evidence of coins shows that the style of Boian art was similar. III.

AJA 47 (1943) 306-12

(Walton)

Procopius. D. S. ROBERTSON. *Procopius*, Hist. Arc. xv.25-35. Theodora's antiphonal jest, *Πατρίκιε ὁ δέινα μεγάλην κήλην ἔχεις*, was metrical. If a proparoxytone, four-syllable name in the vocative, e.g. *Θεόδωρε*, be substituted for *ὁ δέινα* the words will form a perfect 'political verse.' Thus, "Procopius, with characteristic malice, has given his readers some help (though not much) towards identifying the old gentleman whose anonymity he would be thought so careful to preserve." CR 57 (1943) 8-9 (F. P. Jones)

Quintilian. R. G. AUSTIN. *Quintilian*, xii.10.27-8. Quintilian considered Latin harsher than Greek chiefly on two grounds: (1) it lacked certain pleasant sounds possessed by the Greek; (2) it possessed harsh sounds that were lacking in Greek. Examples of the former were *v* and *ξ*, of the latter, *f* and *q*. Commentators on the passage have missed the second point because they overlooked the significance of *velut in et velut in locum earum succedunt tristes et horridae*.

CR 57 (1943) 9-12 (F. P. Jones)

Quintus Smyrnaeus. D. S. ROBERTSON. *Quintus Smyrnaeus*, iii.267-77. In Q. S. iii.276, *ὅπως σύνες ἀρφή λέοντα σύνεις* is inappropriate and without parallel. Instead, read *κύνεις*, which brings the close of the passage back to the simile with which it began in 267-8.

CR 57 (1943) 6-7 (F. P. Jones)

Seneca. WILLIAM HARDY ALEXANDER. *Seneca's Dialogi III, IV, V De Ira Libri Tres. The Text Emended and Explained*. Continues the writer's principles of criticism, already applied to the text of the 'Epistulae Morales.' "Of these principles the most important is the belief that in many passages a proper explanation of the manuscript reading proves much more satisfactory than emendation." About sixty passages discussed.

California Publications in

Classical Philology 12 (1943) 225-54 (C. T. M.)

Sophocles. H. J. Rose. *Sophocles*, O. T. 530-1. Pap. Oxyrh. 2180, in omitting O. T. 531, *αὐτὸς δ' ὁδὸς ἡδη δωμάτων ἔξω περᾶ*, preserves the text as the author wrote it. The line was probably inserted from stage copy.

CR 57 (1943) 5 (F. P. Jones)